

A Tesoro de la Lengua Castellana o Español Version 2.0

Review of:

Lexikon of the Hispanic Baroque: Transatlantic Exchange and Transformation, edited by Evonne Levy and Kenneth Mills, Austin: University of Texas Press, 2013, pp., 91 b. & w. illus., £49.00 hdbk, ISBN 9780292753099.

Byron Hamann

LEXICON, is the same as vocabulary, Greek name λεξικον, from λεξις *dictio*. Dictionary.

--Sebastián de Covarrubias Orozco, *El Tesoro de la Lengua Castellana o Español*, folio 523 r.¹

Just over 400 years ago, in 1611, royal chaplain Sebastián de Covarrubias Orozco published the first monolingual dictionary of (as he put it) 'Castilian or Spanish'. In many ways, his work is more of an encyclopedia than a dictionary. It contains only 5,500 entries (Spanish-to-a-second-language translating dictionaries from the same period included over 20,000), and the definitions can go on for paragraphs, if not pages (the entry for ELEPHANT is ten and a half). As a whole, the lexical explorations in the *Tesoro* provide fascinating windows onto the mental world of early modern Iberians.

With their new *Lexikon of the Hispanic Baroque: Transatlantic Exchange and Transformation*, editors Evonne Levy and Kenneth Mills create a twenty-first-century analog to Covarrubias' classic tome, by way of Raymond Williams.² They have chosen 43 critical terms--or 'technologies' as Levy and Mills describe them--and commissioned two entries for each: one written from the perspective of Spain, the other from the perspective of Spanish America. Some of the categories are perhaps predictable, in terms of contemporary assumptions about the Hispanic world: *Clergy, Governance, Inquisition, Mission, Rebellion, Saint*. Others, however, are less

¹ LEXICON, es lo mesmo que vocabulario, nombre Griego λεξικον, de λεξις dictio. Dicionario.

² Raymond Williams, *Keywords: A Vocabulary of Culture and Society*, London: Croom Helm Ltd., 1976. *Keywords* is quite parallel in scope to the *Lexikon*, featuring 110 categories (compared to the 86 total entries on Spain plus Spanish America).

expected, and help bring a sense of Baroque irregularity to the project: *Animal, Comedy, Dream, Library, Living Image, Love, Opera, Ship, Sodomy*, as well as three separate entries for *Music* (*Music: Cathedrals, Music: Convents, and Music: Missions*).³ As these categories make clear, the contributing authors come from a wide range of disciplinary traditions in Spain, Latin America, and North America: Anthropology, History, History of Art and Architecture, Romance Languages etc. Overall, the work is a fascinating document, and helps to create an unexpected trilogy. The year 2013 saw a notable turn to publications on global lexicography, and the *Lexikon* is simultaneously joined on the shelves by Roland Greene's *Five Words: Critical Semantics in the Age of Shakespeare and Cervantes* and Sarah Ogilvie's *Words of the World: A Global History of the Oxford English Dictionary*.

Because of its parallel, Spain/Spanish America structure, the volume also joins a number of edited volumes published over the past decade that join chapters written by specialists of early modern Iberia to chapters written by specialists of early modern Latin America. Indeed, a number of these are cited by the authors (Kenneth Mills and Anthony Grafton's 2003 *Conversion: Old Worlds and New*; Gisela von Wobeser and Enriqueta Vilar Vilar's 2009 *Muerte y vida en el más allá: España y América, siglos XVI-XVIII*), and we could add many more, such as Pedro Cardim and Joan-Lluís Palos' 2012 *El mundo de los virreyes en las monarquías de España y Portugal*. But one of the limitations of these previous volumes has been that their visions of the Spanish Atlantic often remain one of juxtaposition, not integration.⁴ In general, many of the questions asked about the 'Mexican' or 'Peruvian' or 'Guatemalan' past have been different from the questions asked of the 'Spanish' or 'Portuguese' or 'Catalan' past. In part, this is due to archival differences across space and time: differing traces encourage certain kinds of histories and discourage others. We have no Iberian Guaman Poma, for example, denouncing in word and image the exploitation of Extremaduran peasantry during the early seventeenth century. At the same time, these transatlantic differences in the questions and contours of scholarship are the legacy of differing traditions for writing nationalist histories on

³ Indeed, I almost wish that the editors had pushed the project's Baroque category-contours even further, taking cues from Covarrubias and adding entries for *Monster*, say (MONSTRO), or *Eyeglasses* (ANTOJOS; see *Lexikon* pp. 13, 295), *Mirror* (ESPEJO), or *Mummy* (MOMIA; see *Lexikon* pp. 202, 211) – all of which resonated on both shores of the Spanish Atlantic.

⁴ As I discuss in the rest of this paragraph, the corporately-authored nature of edited volumes is not the sole explanation for their geographic bifurcations: surprisingly few monographs have managed to achieve a balanced integration of Spain and Spanish American perspectives. Exceptions include Jorge Cañizares-Esguerra's *How to Write the History of the New World: Histories, Epistemologies, and Identities in the Eighteenth-Century Atlantic World* (2001), Tamar Herzog's *Defining Nations: Immigrants and Citizens in Early Modern Spain and Spanish America* (2003), and Federico Garza Carbajal's *Butterflies Will Burn: Prosecuting Sodomites in Early Modern Spain and Mexico* (2003), and Marcy Norton's *Sacred Gifts, Profane Pleasures: A History of Tobacco and Chocolate in the Atlantic World* (2008).

the eastern versus western shores of the Atlantic. But what makes Levy and Mills' project innovative, and refreshing, is that their focused thematic framework – 43 words – allows some of the best Spain/Spanish American pairs to put what are often very different historiographical traditions into close, productive dialogues. Many of the entry-pair authors cite each other, of course. But I'm thinking in particular about the kinds of conversations generated by one of the volume's most successful pairings, the entries for *Church: Place*, by Jesús Escobar (Spain) and Michael Schreffler (Spanish America). These two contributors have turned their separate entries into a single essay with two halves, with Escobar writing about church patronage in Spain by a Mexican-born Archbishop of Santiago de Compostela, and Schreffler writing about church patronage in Peru by an Iberian-born Bishop of Cusco.

More generally, it was gratifying to see the number of times that the book's structural division of entries between Spain and Spanish America was breached: Amanda Wunder begins her entry on *Dress* (Spain) with a portrait of a woman wearing a textile woven with figures of the New World pineapple (107); Elizabeth Davis ends her discussion of the *Epic* (Spain) with Diego de Hojeda's *La Christianada*, composed in Lima in 1611 (125); Ruth MacKay's contribution on *Labor* (Spain) deals with the economic incentives for migrating to the New World, and quotes a number of letters sent back home on the subject (179-180); Fernando Bouza opens his discussion of *Knowledge* (Spain) with quotations on 'Indians' by Fernando Álvarez de Toledo (171); and Frederick Luciani's *Ship* (Spanish America) begins with a shipwreck in Luis de Góngora's 1627 *Soledades*, and ends with a shipwreck in Carlos de Sigüenza y Góngora's 1690 *Infortunios de Alonso Ramírez* (311, 313-314). As a final example, consider the thematic bridge constructed between the chapters on *Opera* by Louise K. Stein and José A. Rodríguez Garrido. Stein ends her treatment of Spain with the travels and transformations, from Madrid to Lima, of Pedro Calderón de la Barca's 1660-1661 *La púrpura de la Rosa* in 1701 (254). This work then becomes the point of departure for the next entry: Rodríguez Garrido's discussion of opera in Spanish America (256).

But this is, after all, a review for the *Journal of Art Historiography*, and so I will now turn to the ways in which the *Lexikon* engages with questions of visual and material culture. Images are central to the *Lexikon*'s project – it includes 91, more than are found in some art historical monographs. Most of the entries begin with facing full-page illustrations; additional visual materials are integrated into many of the volume's essays. This visual proliferation fascinated me from first opening the volume. In some ways, the inclusion of so many images is not surprising, given the interests of the two editors. Evonne Levy is an art historian; Kenneth Mills (along with William B. Taylor and Sandra Lauderdale Graham) is the editor of *Colonial Latin America: A Documentary History*, a volume that includes as documents objects and images as well as alphabetic texts. I remained intrigued by this aspect of the volume's design throughout my reading, and being an anthropologist, I contacted

Mills and Levy to ask them about their working method for incorporating images into the volume.

Including a lot of visual materials was important from the project's inception. The actual text+image assembly of the manuscript involved a general call for images from the contributors (many of who were using images as part of their arguments--and not only the art historians, but more on that below), followed by a general search for additional visuals by Levy, which were then further discussed with Mills and particular authors. In other words, even when specific images are not engaged with by the authors of the entries they accompany, they have a story to tell. Mills and Levy put it this way:

we wanted the images genuinely to complement the project at every turn, and beyond that, even to offer a kind of subtext and counter-text at times, exceeding the words, departing from the entries, providing an additional evocation of those words for all kinds of readers. We hoped that the frontispiece images would draw in the reader, carry a lot but not necessarily parrot the arguments of the text (as in, most suggestively, *Clergy-Spain*, and *Ship-Americas*).

Moving from this general vision to particular entries, readers of the *Journal of Art Historiography* will be pleased to know that many of the volume's entries are written by art historians, and/or engage with eminently art-historical themes: *Cartography*, *Church: Interior*, *Church: Place*, *Dress*, *Engraving*, *Living Image*. Many of these contributions--as we might expect--develop their arguments through the analysis of images, and the same is true for the illustration-filled *Introduction* by editors Levy and Mills. Gridley McKim-Smith's entry on *Dress* in Spanish America, for example, centres on three objects: an *uncu* from the sixteenth-century Andes, an early *casta* painting from 1711 Mexico City, and an embroidered shawl from circa 1790 Mexico. Victor L. Stoichita's dazzling chapter on the *Living Image* in Spain underscores its arguments about the uncanny with four incarnations (in oil paint, drawing, etching, and sculpture) of the same basic image: St. Francis standing erect, mouth open, eyes uplifted, hands clasped yet hidden in the voluminous sleeves of his habit.

At the same time, one of the pleasures of the *Lexikon* is that image-discussions are not limited to chapters by art historians, or to categories with obviously visual themes. A number of authors from different disciplines include references to images in their entries, and use those images as a source of evidence to further their arguments. Linguistic anthropologist Alan Durston, for example, begins his chapter on *Language* (Spanish America) with a photograph of the frescoed entryway to the seventeenth-century baptismal chapel in the parish church of San Pedro Andahuaylillas (190). The portal is framed with alphabetic letters: the sacramental formula 'I baptize you in the name of the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit' written in five languages (Latin, Spanish, Quechua, Aymara, Puquina). But this

is not simply an image of multilingual coexistence, Durston argues: it is about linguistic hierarchy. Latin appears at the top, and then Spanish, and then Quechua--the imperial language of the Inka. These three languages of empire dominate the more 'local' speech of Aymara, and the now-extinct Puqina. Beatriz de Alba-Koch weaves a transatlantic visual history into her entry on the *Dream* in Spanish America, showing how a frontispiece of Francisco de Quevedo dreaming at his desk (published in Antwerp in 1699, and used as the opening image to Enrique Fernández-Rivera's preceding chapter on the *Dream* in Spain) inspired both a 1796 drawing in the manuscript of New Spanish poet Francisco Eduardo Tresguerras' *Sueño Verdadero* (102) as well as--and at about the same time--Francisco de Goya y Lucientes' 1799 nightmare image of *El sueño de la razón produce monstruos*.

In addition (thinking here more broadly about the world of material culture), many of the entries contain fascinating glimpses into the unexpected tangibilities of the Baroque world: dark-tinted glasses in Ramón Mujica Pinilla's *Afterlife* (13); an Escorial built out of stones gathered from all of the regions of Spain, as well as wood salvaged from Spanish shipwrecks on the shores of Asia, in Carlos M. N. Eire's *Center* (35); the late sixteenth-century importation of closed confessional boxes from Milan to Spain in Sara T. Nalle's *Confession* (84); detailed rules about the physical properties of convents, from the dimensions of *celosía* apertures to the size of *tornos*, in Elizabeth A. Lehfeltdt's *Convent* (92).

Should a second edition appear, I would add two minor expansions. First, given that the volume includes dozens of contributors from perhaps as many departments and disciplines, it would be useful to include a metalexicon of (brief) contributor biographies: both to understand how the styles and substance of the various entries are refracted through various disciplinary formations and academic locations, as well to provide a sociological snapshot of Hispanic World Studies in the early twenty-first century. Second, I would push the images even further into the realm of Baroque playfulness, and work to blur the borders of text and image in the volume. As historians of the book have made clear, the alphabetic layouts of book-pages are visual objects no less than their iconographically-loaded frontispieces. At a number of times in the *Lexikon* – and in entries which were still seeking their opening images – authors described fascinating text-artefacts that would have been great to see in tandem with Durston's Andahuaylillas portal: from Manuel Peña Díaz's entry on *Language* (Spain), the closing folios of a 1606 history of Castilian that transcribe the Lords' Prayer in Latin, Castilian, Catalan, Italian, and Portuguese (186); from Sarah H. Beckford's entry on *Love* (Spanish America), the Quechua love songs ('Is it because you are my blue flower, my yellow flower? / In my mind, in the depths of my heart?') copied into Guaman Poma's *El primer nueva corónica y buen gobierno* (217); and from Louise M. Burkhart's entry on *Religious Drama* (Spanish America), scripts of Nahuatl adaptations of Lope de Vega's *La Madre de la Mejor* and Calderón de la Barca's *El gran teatro del mundo* (284). Four of the volume's categories engage with sonic history (the three sets of entries for *Music*, and *Opera* as well), and photos of surviving scores would add considerably to those

pages. Above all, for Piotr Nawrot's entry on *Music: Missions* (248), it would have been fascinating to see samples of the nth-generation manuscript copies of Baroque music in indigenous languages being made by inhabitants of former Jesuit missions as late as 2005. The material turn in the humanities and social sciences is now well-established, but sonic history – provocatively incorporated into this *Lexikon's* view of the Baroque past – too often remains marginal.

Byron Ellsworth Hamann's studies the art and writing of prehispanic Mesoamerica, as well as on the connections linking the Americas and Europe in the early modern Mediterratlantic world. Theoretically, his work explores the histories of globalizations, commodity circulations, landscape interpretations, the nature of writing, methods of archival research, processes of religious conflict and toleration in sixteenth-century Christian-Muslim and Christian-Native American contexts, and the legacies of the antique Mediterranean in early modern Spanish America. His doctoral training was in Anthropology and History; he currently teaches in the Department of History of Art at Ohio State University.

byronhamann@gmail.com